
From: Dennis and Sharon Noble <dsnoble@shaw.ca>
Sent: Monday, October 19, 2015 5:35 PM
To: Commission Secretary BCUC:EX
Subject: BC Hydro Rate Design Application
Attachments: OPT OUT FEES draft Sept, 2015- analogs highlighted.docx

Dear Commissioner Hamilton,

I was under the impression that the deadline for the submission of comments had been extended, and was advised of my misunderstanding only late this afternoon. This submission will be dated Oct. 19 and I submit it for consideration.

Comments pertain to Appendix B to Order G-156-15, Point 5, “any other relevant matters that parties wish to bring to the attention of the Panel before the procedural conference.”

- 1) The legacy fees as charged by BC Hydro are the highest in North America. Attached is a chart showing fees and sources of the information. Why are the fees so much higher than other utilities? Are BC Hydro salaries that much higher? Is BC Hydro less efficient than other utilities? What costs are being incurred by BC Hydro that are not incurred by other utilities?
- 2) Why do the costs not include the option to keep an analog meter, as many utilities in the US allow?
- 3) As of the last count provided by BC Hydro, approximately 50,000 smart meters are being read manually, with no additional costs assessed. What are the associated costs? What is the cause for the delay in activating these meters? How are the associated costs being recovered? Is it through the legacy fees?
- 4) Will all of the 50,000 smart meters that are manually read be activated and become fully functional? If not, how many will continue to be read manually indefinitely, and why?
- 5) Are there financial reports accounting for the additional fees that have been collected, including the additional costs incurred for the legacy meters alone?

Approximately a month ago I have requested them and have been told a response is being prepared.

- 6) Is there a financial report showing the current status of the smart meter program opposite the business case that was initially presented? This should include:
 - a) Costs paid to individuals for damages incurred during and after installation;
 - b) Costs paid to insurance companies for damages incurred.
 - c) Costs that were not anticipated, e.g. for meters that do not function in an urban setting with concrete walled electrical rooms.

- 7) What are the ongoing maintenance costs projected for the program once it is finished?
 - a) Replacement of smart meters as their life spans are reached? In the US meters are being replaced when they reach the 10-12 year period.
 - b) What additional costs are anticipated regarding software and computer upgrades on an ongoing basis?
 - c) What additional costs are projected to meet international security standards?
 - d) Are there additional insurance costs to cover security breaches, hacking incidents, fires, etc?

- 8) Many utilities in the US and elsewhere are anticipating a “death spiral” as a result of increased costs and tactics by the utility companies which are unwelcomed. BC Hydro faces a similar spiral, with many customers either having gone off the grid, or anticipating doing so as a result, in a large degree, to the smart meter program. As more customers employ new technology to obtain electricity, separate from BC Hydro, rates will have to increase to cover investments and new projects, such as ongoing costs of the smart meter program, Site C, etc. and more people will go off the grid, and so on. Various industry projections conclude that ultimately only those who cannot afford to go off the grid, e.g. those with young families, the disabled, or those on fixed incomes, will continue to be BC Hydro customers.

What plans are being made by BC Hydro to prepare for this spiral? Are contingency funds being established to reduce the financial impact on those people who will remain on the grid?

9) What meeting was held that determined that there were no concerns regarding pricing and costs associated with the smart meter program? I for one have many concerns and have voiced them to BC Hydro, BC Utilities Commission, and this government.

Respectfully,

Sharon Noble

818 Bexhill Place

Victoria, BC V9C 3V5

SMART METER OPT OUT OPTIONS AND FEES – draft Sept, 2015

UTILITY	ONE-TIME CHARGE	MONTHLY CHARGE	OPT-OUT OPTION	NOTES
CANADA				
British Columbia: BC Hydro	NO FEE \$22.60 (plus \$55 charge to exit Opt Out and accept Smart Meter) ¹ \$65.00 “failed	\$32.40 \$20	Current Meter (ANALOG or DIGITAL) –then “LEGACY METER²” when current meter expires, then RADIO- OFF METER when customer moves or when BC Hydro’s inventory of legacy meters is exhausted RADIO-OFF METER ³	Proposed Fees ⁴ . B.C. Utilities Commission interim approval ⁵ . April 25, 2014 - BC Hydro Application for Approval of Charges Related to Meter Choices Program ~ Decision ⁶ The BCUC decision notes: “As a result of the prescriptive nature of Direction No. 4, the issues within scope in this public hearing are very narrow. They are limited to whether the proposed charges would enable BC Hydro to recover expenditures that are considered program costs, investigation costs and infrastructure costs to the extent that BC Hydro requests their recovery and the amount of the

² “legacy meter” means an electricity meter, other than a smart meter or a radio-off meter, that is of a type in use by the authority <http://www.bcuc.com/Documents/SpecialDirections/2013/OIC-391-SD4-BCHSMI-Options.pdf>

³ “radio-off meter” means a smart meter adjusted so that the meters components that transmit data by radio are deactivated <http://www.bcuc.com/Documents/SpecialDirections/2013/OIC-391-SD4-BCHSMI-Options.pdf>

⁴ BC Hydro: METER CHOICES http://www.bchydro.com/energy-in-bc/projects/smart_metering_infrastructure_program/smart_meter_installation/installation_preparation/meter-choice.html?WT.mc_id=rd_meterchoice

⁵ BC Utilities Commission Order G-166-13.
http://www.bcuc.com/Documents/Proceedings/2013/DOC_36246_A-1_G-166-13_BCH-Meter-Choice-Program.pdf

⁶ April 25, 2014 - BC Hydro Application for Approval of Charges Related to Meter Choices Program ~ Decision http://www.bcuc.com/Documents/Proceedings/2014/DOC_41266_04-25-2014_BCH%20Meter%20Choices_Decision_G-59-14.pdf

	installation charge” if a customer refuses meter exchange or obstructs access			failed installation charge.”
British Columbia: FortisBC	<p>\$88 for those with an unwanted Smart Meter (“AMI meter”)</p> <p>\$60 for those who choose a radio-off AMI meter before meter installations begin in their region. ⁷</p>	\$9 (\$18 per read every 2 months)	RADIO-OFF METER	
Quebec: Hydro-Québec	<p>\$15 before 30 day deadline</p> <p>\$85 after 30 day deadline⁸</p>	\$5	NON-COMMUNICATING ELECTRONIC METER	<p>Hydro-Québec asked the Régie de l’énergie to authorize a review of the opting-out costs and conditions.⁹</p> <p>Hydro-Québec reduced fees in May 2014, but in a ruling released Sep 24, 2014, the Régie de l’énergie found that even the reduced fees were too high and ordered Hydro-Québec to cut them by nearly 60 per cent.</p> <p>Energy Minister Pierre Arcand said he was happy with the ruling, calling it a victory for consumers. “We don’t need to penalize the consumer who use those kinds of meters,” he said.¹⁰</p>

⁷ <http://www.fortisbc.com/About/ProjectsPlanning/ElecUtility/ProjectsInYourCommunity/AdvancedMeteringInfrastructure/Pages/Radio-off-option.aspx>

⁸ Quebec energy board cuts fees for smart-meter opt-out - Hydro-Québec ordered to reduce opt-out fee by \$33, CBC News:Sep 24, 2014 <http://www.cbc.ca/m/touch/canada/montreal/story/1.2776587>

⁹ Hydro-Québec to reduce opt-out cost for smart meters, Montréal Gazette, November 22, 2013 [HTTP://WWW.MONTREALGAZETTE.COM/BUSINESS/HYDRO+QU%C3%A9bec+WANTS+REDUCE+COST+SMART+METERS/9202667/STORY.HTML](http://www.montrealgazette.com/BUSINESS/HYDRO+QU%C3%A9bec+WANTS+REDUCE+COST+SMART+METERS/9202667/STORY.HTML)

¹⁰ Hydro-Québec ordered to reduce opt-out fee, CBC News, Sep 24, 2014

				(Initial fee before 30 day deadline - was \$98, lowered to \$48 May 2014, now \$15 Initial fee after 30 day deadline was \$137, now \$85 monthly Reading fee was \$17.17, reduced to \$8, now \$5)
Quebec: Hydro Westmount	\$99 (waived if the analog has expired) ¹¹	\$5	NON-RF METER	By-law adopted April 8, 2014.
UNITED STATES				
Arizona: Tucson Electric Power Co ¹²	\$20 (proposed – need update)	\$10 \$5 per-month if you read your own meter. (proposed)	ELECTRO-MECHANICAL/ANALOG – with self-read option	TEP is honouring requests to keep the analog meter, but has not yet begun charging fees. (Nov 2013)
Arizona: Arizona Public Service ¹³	No fee for existing analog meters	\$5	ANALOG	Docket No. E-01345A-13-0069: “ORDER: IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that Arizona Public Service

¹¹ **City brings in promised opt-out from RF Hydro Meters**, Westmount Independent, April 15, 2014 <http://citizensforsafetechnology.org/City-brings-in-promised-optout-from-RF-Hydro-Meters--Westmount-Quebec,15,3880>

Pdf of original article: <http://www.westmountindependent.com/Wlv8.4c.pdf>

¹² **Utility 'smart meters' raise health, expense concerns**, Arizona Daily Star, May 16, 2013 http://azstarnet.com/mobi/latest/article_ed579a26-59b3-5dfe-ad09-cf5168f44025.html

¹³ **State settles 'smart' meter debate**, The Republic | azcentral.com, December 13, 2014 <http://www.azcentral.com/story/money/business/2014/12/12/state-settles-smart-meter-debate/20343257/>

	\$50 analog re-installation fee if Smart Meter is already installed			<p>Company's Service Schedule 17 is approved as modified by Staffs Alternative 1 except that the monthly meter reading charge is set at five dollars (\$5) and that a one-time fifty dollars set-up fee be assessed only for those Arizona Public Service Company customers with an AMI meter already in place."¹⁴</p> <p>The Utility had proposed a one-time fee of \$75 plus \$30 a month.¹⁵</p> <p>Note: A judge recently ruled that Plumas-Sierra Rural Electric Cooperative smart meters opt-out fees violate state discrimination laws in a case where the utility cut off electricity 14 months ago for a customer suffering from electromagnetic hypersensitivity. The judge cited California law stating public utilities cannot prejudice, disadvantage or require different rates or deposit amounts from a person because of a medical condition.¹⁶</p>
Arizona: Salt River Project	NO FEE	\$20.00		
California	\$75.00 \$10.00 for low-income customers ¹⁷	\$10.00; or \$5.00 for low-income customers	ANALOG	The California Public Utilities Commission agreed to allow electric customers to keep their current analog meter or reinstall an analog meter if a smart meter had been installed February 1, 2012. ¹⁸

¹⁴Docket No. E-01345A-13-0069 BEFORE THE ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION: IN THE MATER OF ARIZONA PUBLIC SERVICE COMPANY APPLICATION FOR APPROVAL OF AUTOMATED METER OPT-OUT SERVICE SCHEDULE 17 <http://images.edocket.azcc.gov/docketpdf/0000159381.pdf>

¹⁵ **APS smart meters worry residents**, Verde Independent, Oct 11, 2013 <http://verdenews.com/main.asp?SectionID=1&SubsectionID=1&ArticleID=56641>

¹⁶ **Judge rules electric co-op violated discrimination laws**, Plumas County News, May 4, 2015 <http://plumasnews.com/index.php/13744-judge-rules-electric-co-op-violated-discrimination-laws>

¹⁷ **PUC Orders PG&E to Offer Analog Meters as Sole Smart Meter Opt-Out Option**, La Mesa – Mount Helix Patch, January 17, 2012, <http://lamesa.patch.com/groups/susan-brinchmans-blog/p/bp-puc-orders-pge-to-offer-analog-meters-as-smart-me4240b673a5>

¹⁸ **California Public Utilities Commission's Decision Modifying Pacific Gas and Electric Company's SmartMeter Program to Include an Opt-out Plan:** http://docs.cpuc.ca.gov/word_pdf/AGENDA_DECISION/158309.pdf

California: Los Angeles Department of Water and Power (LADWP) - 52,000 meter pilot project	NO FEE	NO FEE – including free reinstallation of analog meter ¹⁹	ANALOG	Marcelo Di Paolo, manager of the LADWP Smart Grid project, has stated that the project is “purely a volunteer optional program” and that the community can “pick and actually choose whether or not to participate.” ²⁰
California: Sacramento Municipal Utility District (SMUD) - Sacramento County	\$127 (can be spread out over 3 years) ²¹	\$14 (meter read every third month)	DIGITAL meter with Time-of-Use (TOU) Bi-Directional metering capabilities, and Electronic LCD display (NTDM Itron Centron meter or Itron Sentine Meter) – OR GE I70-S ANALOG meter if requested.	some people have experienced health issues with the digital meters; ANALOG replacements are available on request
Colorado: La Plata Electric Association	\$6.67 (\$20 per quarter) ²²	NO FEE	ANALOG	
Florida: Florida Power & Light Co.	\$89 ²³ (reduced from proposed \$105) ²⁴	\$13 (reduced from proposed \$16)	Current meter (ANALOG), then NON-COMMUNICATING METER when it needs replacement.²⁵	Acting as attorney on behalf of opt-out customers, a former Florida Public Service Commissioner filed a petition with FPSC March 31, 2014 objecting to the fees, arguing that FPL is seeking advanced recovery for the cost of possibly unnecessary visits to customers

¹⁹ LADWP letter to customer <http://stopsmartgrid.org/>

²⁰ Cindy Sage Challenges the “Smart” in LADWP’s “Smart” Grid: LADWP project manager guarantees “smart” meters are optional! May 14, 2013 <http://emfsafetynetwork.org/cindy-sage-challenges-the-smart-in-ladwps-smart-grid/>

²¹ Opting out of SMUD smart meters, <https://www.smud.org/en/residential/customer-service/smart-meters/optiming-out.htm>

²² Smart-meter opt outs allowed durangoherald.com Nov 19, 2014 <http://durangoherald.com/article/20141119/NEWS01/141119465/Smart-meter-opt-outs-allowed->

²³ Florida Public Service Commission News Releases Florida PSC Reduces FPL Non-Standard Meter Customer Charge, Dec 18, 2014 <http://www.psc.state.fl.us/home/news/index.aspx?id=1214>

²⁴ FPL sets higher charge for customers refusing smart meters, Orlando Sentinel, January 7, 2014 http://www.orlandosentinel.com/business/os-dumb-electric-meter-charge-20140107_0_4390998.story
http://www.wptv.com/dpp/news/region_c_palm_beach_county/west_palm_beach/fpl-smart-meter-update-there-will-be-a-monthly-fee-if-you-refuse-a-smart-meter#ixzz2sxt802Ij

²⁵ Florida Public Service Commission Docket # 130223, filed by Florida Power & Light <http://www.floridapsc.com/dockets/cms/docketFilings3.aspx?docket=130223>

				who simply keep their old meters. The petition also says that the fees fail to account for the cost savings because FPL did not have the expense of installing a meter for those who opted out. (In 2010 an FPL official testified that the Smart Meters would save \$30 million by 2013, but the projected savings have not materialized). ²⁶
Florida: The City of Lakeland electric utility	NO FEE for those who opted out before March 1, 2013. \$65 meter equipment fee after March 1	\$16.25	ANALOG	Lakeland City commissioners approved fees November 5, 2012. ²⁷
Georgia: Georgia Power	No Fee to keep analog meter No fee to have Smart Meter removed.	\$19 ²⁸	ANALOG – (keep old one or have analog re-installed after Smart Meter removed)²⁹	On December 17, 2013 the Georgia Public Service Commission approved a Smart Meter Opt-Out tariff as part of Georgia Power's 2013 rate case. Customers who opt out of having a smart meter installed and prefer to maintain a mechanical meter at their residence or facility can now do so with a basic service charge of \$19 per month. Customers can also request removal of their smart meters for no extra charge.
Hawaii: The Kauai Island Utility Cooperative	\$50.64 residential \$138.80 commercial ³⁰	\$10.27	ANALOG	Approved by the Hawaii Public Utilities Commission Nov 2013 ³¹ Kauai Island Utility Cooperative voted to keep the fees Jan 2014 ³²

²⁶ **Former PSC commissioner files smart meter petition on behalf of Loxahatchee couple**, Palm Beach Post, March 31, 2014 <http://www.palmbeachpost.com/news/news/former-psc-commissioner-files-smart-meter-petition/nfPdP/>

²⁷ **Lakeland Officials Approve Fee to Opt-Out of Smart Meter Program**, The Ledger, November 5, 2012 <http://www.theledger.com/article/20121105/POLITICS/121109627>

²⁸ **For a price, Georgia Power customers can opt out of smart meters**, SavannahNow.com, January 22, 2014 <http://savannahnow.com/exchange/2014-01-22/price-georgia-power-customers-can-opt-out-smart-meters#.UulH9ZoWLbg>

²⁹ **Georgia Public Service Commission Smart Meter Q & A** <http://www.psc.state.ga.us/electric/smartMeter/>

³⁰ **Non-smart meters fees approved**, The Garden Island, November 3, 2013 http://thegardenisland.com/news/local/non-smart-meters-fees-approved/article_f64efbd2-444f-11e3-a7eb-0019bb2963f4.html

³¹ **KIUC ballot set, election begins Jan. 3**, The Garden Island, December 18, 2013 http://thegardenisland.com/news/local/kiuc-ballot-set-election-begins-jan/article_2b77f420-67ab-11e3-b977-0019bb2963f4.html

³² **Kauai utility votes to keep smart meter opt-out fees**, Star-Advertiser, Jan 26, 2014 http://www.staradvertiser.com/news/breaking/20140126_Kauai_utility_votes_to_keep_meter_optout_fees.html?id=242091521

Hawaii: Hawaiian Electric Co				HECO says it plans to offer customers an opt-out provision similar to that of the Kauai Island Utility ³³
Illinois: Commonwealth Edison Co - northern Illinois service territory	No Fee	\$21.53 ³⁴	ANALOG	****As of August 2015, ComEd does not offer a permanent opt-out. A resident can get a delay and pay the \$21.53 per month until ComEd circles around at the end of deployment and puts on a smart meter. ComEd has 4,000,000 customers in Illinois.
Illinois: Ameren Illinois -both electric and natural gas meters	No Fee to keep analog; \$70 to reinstall analog If customers change their mind. ³⁵	\$20.00	ANALOG	The Illinois Commerce Commission approved the fees Sept. 3, 2014
Maine: Central Maine Power	a.\$40 b.\$20.00	a.\$12 b. \$10.50	a. ELECTRO-MECHANICAL b. a standard wireless smart meter with the internal network interface card operating in receive-only mode (transmitter off)	On May 17, 2011 the Maine Public Utilities Commission ordered CMP to create an opt out program for customers who do not want a wireless smart meter ³⁶ As of July 2012, the Maine Supreme Judicial Court has ruled that the PUC failed to properly address health and safety concerns. The Public Utilities Commission has opened a docket to examine the health and safety issues. ³⁷ Bill LD 826 - An Act To Eliminate the Opt-out Charges for Smart Meters ³⁸ , which prohibits a utility from charging a fee or a higher

³³ HECO moves to install controversial smart meters, Jul 03, 2013 <http://www.hawaiinewsnow.com/story/22758923/heco-moves-to-install-controversial-smart-grids>

³⁴ No smart meter for you? It'll cost you, Chicagobusiness.com, February 06, 2014 <http://www.chicagobusiness.com/article/20140206/NEWS11/140209838/no-smart-meter-for-you-itll-cost-you#>

³⁵ 'Smart meter' refusal comes at a cost, herald-review.com, September 22, 2014 http://herald-review.com/news/local/smart-meter-refusal-comes-at-a-cost/article_dbf05964-ecbf-5b8a-8347-4aaa4f4c9dc9.html

³⁶ PUC Approves smart meter opt out program. <http://www.maine.gov/meopa/utilities/electric/smartgrid.html>

³⁷ Friedman v. Maine Public Utilities Comm., Law Docket No. PUC-11-532 <http://caselaw.findlaw.com/me-supreme-judicial-court/1606139.html>

				rate for declining the installation or for the removal of a wireless smart meter was put forth March 26, 2013 and has been carried over to 2014 regular session. ³⁹
<p>Maryland : Baltimore Gas and Electric Co (BGE)</p> <p>*Opt-out customers who have both electric and gas service pay the fee once to opt-out for both.</p>	<p>\$75.00 (reduced from proposed \$100.00) (Same fee to keep old meter or have Smart Meter replaced by standard meter.)</p>	<p>\$11.00 (reduced from proposed \$15)</p>	<p>ELECTRO-MECHANICAL current analog or digital meter ("legacy meter")</p> <p>Customers who have a Smart Meter but wish to opt out can have current Smart Meter replaced by a "standard" meter</p>	<p>On January 7, 2013, The Maryland Public Service Commission ("MPSC") concluded that the public interest required that customers be allowed the option of declining the installation of a smart meter.</p> <p>On August 6, 2013, Baltimore Gas and Electric Co. and other utilities in Maryland propose opt-out fees.⁴⁰</p> <p>On February 26, 2014, MPSC approved opt-out fees. They will revisit these costs after the percentage of opt-out customers has stabilized and may adjust fees accordingly.⁴¹</p> <p>Two bills are now pending in the Maryland legislature that would prohibit the opt-out fees.⁴²</p>
<p>Maryland: Pepco</p>	<p>\$75.00 (reduced from proposed \$100.00)</p>	<p>\$14.00 (reduced from proposed \$58.00)</p>		
<p>Maryland: Delmarva Power & Light Co</p>	<p>\$75.00</p>	<p>\$17.00</p>		

³⁹Bill eliminates 'opt-out' fee for smart meters in Maine, Maine Sun Journal, March 26, 2013 <http://www.sunjournal.com/news/maine/2013/03/26/bill-eliminates-opt-out-fee-smart-meters-maine/1339124>

- Bill LD 826 -An Act To Eliminate the Opt-out Charges for Smart Meters http://www.mainelegislature.org/legis/bills/bills_126th/billtexts/HP057701.asp

⁴⁰ Utilities propose charges to opt out of smart meter: Estimates don't pass the 'straight-face test,' opponent says, The Baltimore Sun, August 05, 2013 http://articles.baltimoresun.com/2013-08-05/business/bs-bz-smart-meter-opt-out-cost-20130805_1_digital-meters-radio-frequency-emissions-maryland-electric-cooperative

⁴¹ ORDER 86200 BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION OF MARYLAND, February 26, 2014 http://webapp.psc.state.md.us/Intranet/sitesearch/Whats_new/Order%20No.%2086200%20-%20Case%20Nos.%20%209207,%209208,%209294%20-%20Smart%20Meter%20Opt-Out%20Fees.pdf

⁴² Maryland delegates criticize BGE smart meter opt-out fees: Bill has bipartisan support to erase opt-out charges, WBAL-TV 11, Mar 04, 2014 <http://www.wbaltv.com/politics/md-delegate-to-challenge-bge-smart-meters-fees/24794032>

- Locals upset over Smart Meters support Senate Bill 9, WMDT.com. Feb 15, 2015 <http://www.wmdt.com/news/more-local-news/locals-upset-over-smart-meters-support-senate-bill-9/31287120>
- THE PROPOSAL: 2015 HB 516/SB 9 Propose No Cost Smart Meter Opt Out, 2015 MD HB 516 (sponsored by Delegate Glass) and SB 9 (sponsored by Senator McFadden) reported February 25, 2015 <http://www.marylandlegislativewatch.com/2015-hb-516sb-9-propose-no-cost-smart-meter-opt-out/>

Maryland: Southern Maryland Electric Cooperative	(reduced from proposed \$100) \$75.00 (reduced from proposed \$105.32)	(reduced from proposed \$58.00) \$17.00. (reduced from proposed \$34.94)		Charges begin August 2014. ⁴³
Massachusetts: Massachusetts Electric Company, Nantucket Electric, Boston Gas, and Colonial Gas	\$26.00 to remove and replace an existing AMR electric meter ⁴⁴ \$67.00 to remove and replace an existing AMR gas meter	\$11.00 - electric \$13.00 – gas	NON-AMR electric or gas meter	
Michigan: DTE Electric	\$67.20	\$9.80	NON-TRANSMITTING METER	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • On January 12, 2012, the Michigan Public Service Commission opened a review of smart meters.⁴⁵ • In May (DTE Electric) and June (Consumers Energy), 2013, the Michigan Public Service Commission (MPSC) approved non-transmitting meter provisions for residential electric customers^{46 4748}

⁴³ **Cost of not taking a smart meter arrives**, August 08, 2014, The Baltimore Sun http://articles.baltimoresun.com/2014-08-08/business/bs-bz-bge-smart-meters-20140803_1_smart-meters-meters-bge-indoor-meters

⁴⁴ Petition of Massachusetts Electric Company, Nantucket Electric Company, Boston Gas Company, and Colonial Gas Company, each d/b/a National Grid, for approval by the Department of Public Utilities of a residential automatic meter reading opt-out provision set forth in tariffs M.D.P.U. Nos. 1215, 26, and 17., D.P.U. 13-83-A April 30, 2014, page 6 http://web1.env.state.ma.us/DPU/FileRoomAPI/api/Attachments/Get/?path=13-83%2fDPU1383A_FinalOrder.pdf

⁴⁵ Michigan Public Service Commission, Order Opening Docket U-17000: <http://efile.mpsc.state.mi.us/efile/docs/17000/0001.pdf>

⁴⁶ **MPSC Approves Advanced Metering Infrastructure Non-Transmitting Meter Provision for Residential Customers of Consumers Energy Company**, June 28, 2013 http://www.michigan.gov/mpsc/0,4639,7-159-16400_17280-307199--,00.html

⁴⁷ **Michigan Public Service Commission Customer Support Section: Smart Grid and Advanced Metering Infrastructure** http://www.michigan.gov/documents/mpsc/ami_final_426915_7.pdf

⁴⁸ **Debate on ‘smart’ meters rages on in Allen Park**, The News-Herald, June 14, 2014, <http://www.thenewsherald.com/articles/2014/06/14/news/doc539b131d9a337107399222.txt?viewmode=2>

Michigan: Consumers Energy ⁴⁹	\$69.39, if the notice is given before the transmitting meter is installed; \$123.91 to remove a wireless Smart Meter	\$9.72	NON-TRANSMITTING METER	
Nevada: NV Energy	\$52.86 to return to a traditional meter	\$8.82	ANALOG - new analog meters to be installed for all opt-out customers⁵⁰	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> In January, 2013, Nevada Public Utilities Commission agreed to let NV Energy charge opt out fees. The commission also approved analog meters as the alternative to Smart Meters.⁵¹
New Jersey: township of Wyckoff Orange & Rockland Electric, one of the township's two electric utilities		\$15 (proposed) ⁵²		Sept. 1, 2015: Orange & Rockland Electric asked for a letter of support from the Wyckoff Township Committee to install new meters that would trigger a rate increase of \$4.84 per month . Customers would be allowed to opt out of the new meter, but would be charged \$15 per month to do so.
New York: Long Island Gas	\$95.64 to remove AMR meter and install non-AMR meter ⁵³	\$7.77		
New York: Central Hudson Gas & Electric Corp. (Ulster County)	tba	tba		Ulster County legislators voted 12-0 December 17, 2014 in favor of a resolution urging the state Legislature prohibit electric utilities

⁴⁹ Court of Appeals, State of Michigan Docket No. 317434;
https://gallery.mailchimp.com/d3fcfc4e39a5d54c6aa5b70fc/files/317456_Consumers_Energy_Motion_Denied_Judge_O_Connell_Opinon.pdf?utm_source=Smart+Meter+Education+Network+Newsletter++1-9-15&utm_campaign=d91b0643a5-appeals+court%2C+smen&utm_medium=email&utm_term=0_3ad4eb3057-d91b0643a5-94785977

⁵⁰ **NV Energy customers can opt for 'refurbished' old-style meters**, Las Vega Sun, Jan. 9, 2013 <http://www.lasvegassun.com/news/2013/jan/09/nv-energy-customers-can-opt-old-style-meters/>

⁵¹ **Smart Meters Battle Ends For Good**, Las Vegas Review-Journal, January 9, 2013 <http://www.reviewjournal.com/business/energy/smart-meters-battle-ends-good>

⁵² **Public utility pitches smart meters in Wyckoff** , Wyckoff Suburban News, September 17, 2015 <http://www.northjersey.com/news/business/new-meters-not-so-fast-1.1411684>

⁵³ Long Island Gas, The KEDLI Gas Company LI - Decline AMR Meter Application Form (National Grid Customer Service 1-800-930-5003.)
http://files.meetup.com/1514058/LIGAS_DECLINE_AMR_Meter.pdf

				from forcing consumers to use so-called smart meters or transmitting utility meters on their homes. ⁵⁴
New Mexico: New Mexico Gas Company	NO FEE	NO FEE	ANALOG – SELF READ: Customers send in own meter readings once a month	
Oklahoma Public Service Co. of Oklahoma	\$183 to replace Smart Meter	\$28 ⁵⁵		
OREGON: Portland General Electric Company ⁵⁶	\$254 Fee is the same whether replacing a Smart Meter or an old (analog) meter ⁵⁷	\$51	NON-COMMUNICATING (radio off) Unwanted Smart Meters will be exchanged. Some analogs still operating as of spring 2014, but these will be replaced.	As of April, 2014 Portland General Electric Company had 14 customers who have chosen to have a non-standard, non-networking meter installed.
OREGON: Ashland Electric Department ⁵⁸	NO FEE	NO FEE	ANALOG	
OREGON: Eugene Water & Electric Board	NO FEE	NO FEE	ANALOG	Opt-In Plan: customers who want a smart meter would have to call EWEB to get one installed. Those who don't ask for one won't get one. ⁵⁹

⁵⁴ **Ulster County lawmakers back opt-out proposal for electronic utility meters**, Daily Freeman, Dec/17, 2013, <http://www.dailyfreeman.com/general-news/20131217/ulster-county-lawmakers-back-opt-out-proposal-for-electronic-utility-meters#comments>

⁵⁵ **Smart meter 'opt outs' best handled by market**, The Oklahoman Editorial Board, June 18, 2015 <http://newsok.com/article/5428340>

⁵⁶ **Could smart meters pose health risks? Some say yes**, KATU Problem Solver, Mar 25, 2013 <http://www.katu.com/news/local/Could-smart-meters-pose-health-risks-Some-say-yes-199882821.html>

⁵⁷ Customer service 503 – 228 -6322

⁵⁸ **Ashland drops smart meter opt-out fee**, The Associated Press, June 12, 2012, <http://projects.registerguard.com/web/newslocalnews/28216815-41/meters-ashland-smart-opt-health.html.csp>

- A Resolution Adopting An Opt Out Policy For The Automated Meter Reading Program, May 17, 2012 <http://www.ashland.or.us/SIB/files/2012-14%20AMR%20Opt%20Out%20Policy.pdf>

⁵⁹ **Voluntary 'Smart' Meter Option Is Adopted**, , OCT. 2, 2013 <http://www.registerguard.com/rg/news/local/30540231-75/meters-smart-eweb-meter-million.html.csp>

Tennessee: Memphis Light, Gas and Water Divison	NO FEE ⁶⁰	NO FEE		
Vermont:	NO FEE NO FEE to have Smart Meter removed ⁶¹	NO FEE	ANALOG	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> On May 18, 2012, Governor Peter Shumlin signed into law S. 214 (Act 0170) allowing for smart meter installation if utility company (1) provides prior written notice to the customer indicating that the meter will use radio or other wireless means for two-way communication between the meter and the company and informing the customer of his or her rights; (2) allows a customer to choose not to have a wireless smart meter installed, at no additional monthly or other charge; and (3) allows a customer to require removal of a previously installed wireless smart meter for any reason and at an agreed-upon time, without incurring any charge for such removal.⁶²
Virginia: Dominion Virginia Power	NO FEE currently, but Dominion Virginia Power will be going before the State Corporation Commission of Virginia and requesting to charge fees. ⁶³	NO FEE currently, but Dominion Virginia Power will be going before the State Corporation Commission of Virginia and requesting to charge fees.	NON-COMMUNICATING METERS - smart meters with both the two-way communications and data storage features disabled.	Dominion Virginia Power has eliminated from all the meters the 2nd antenna that keeps track of what appliances are using how much electricity at any given time. ⁶⁴

⁶⁰ No Smart Meter Opt Out Fee for Memphis MLGW Customers, October 3, 2013 <http://thetruthaboutsmartgrids.org/2013/10/03/no-opt-out-fee-in-memphis/>

⁶¹ Vermont 'Smart Meter' Opposition: No Opt Out Fee under New Legislation, Huffington Post, May 14, 2012, http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2012/05/14/vermont-smart-meters-opposition_n_1514544.html

⁶² S. 214 (Act 0170), AN ACT RELATING TO VERMONT ENERGY ACT OF 2012, at pp. 61-63: <http://www.leg.state.vt.us/docs/2012/Acts/ACT170.pdf>

⁶³ Dominion Virginia Power: Interim Non-Communicating Meter Option Requirements <https://www.dom.com/about/conservation/pdf/meter-option-requirements.pdf>

<p>Washington State: Port Angeles City Council Public Works and Utilities</p>	<p>NO FEE - Smart Meter Program ended</p>	<p>NO FEE</p>	<p>All Smart-meter components that wirelessly transmit will be removed</p>	<p>City residents voiced repeated objections to the project, citing health concerns over the electromagnetic energy employed by the wireless devices. City Council approved a \$1.8 million settlement with Mueller Systems LLC to end the “Smart” Meter program. All water and electric meters will be free of the controversial, electromagnetic Smart Meter components.⁶⁵</p>
--	---	---------------	---	---

⁶⁴ Dominion: Smart Meter FAQs: Are there alternatives to receiving a smart meter? <https://www.dom.com/about/conservation/smartmeter-faqs.jsp>

⁶⁵ **Proposed \$1.8 million settlement would end Port Angeles ‘smart’ meter dispute**, Peninsula Daily News, October 19, 2014 <http://www.peninsuladailynews.com/article/20141019/news/310199902/proposed-18-million-settlement-would-end-port-angeles>